CHAPTER 9: URBAN DESIGN AND VISUAL RESOURCES

9.1 INTRODUCTION

This chapter presents the analysis of the effects of the Fulton Street Transit Center (FSTC) on urban design and visual resources. The urban design characteristics of a neighborhood are comprised of various components in the buildings and streets of an area. These urban design characteristics include:

- Natural features;
- Block form and street pattern;
- Street hierarchy;
- Streetscape elements;
- Building bulk, use and type; and,
- Building arrangements.

Visual resources of a neighborhood define its visual character and identity. An area’s visual resources are its unique or important public view corridors, vistas, or natural or built features. Visual resources may include views of public parks, waterfront, historic and landmark structures or districts, horizon and sky, or natural resources, as well as size and shape of buildings, layout of street blocks and patterns, topography, views and exposure to sunlight.

The construction and operation of the FSTC has the potential to affect the urban design and visual resources of the surrounding area. This chapter considers the potential effects of the FSTC on the areas from which it would be visible, primarily Broadway, Fulton, John and Dey Streets and the World Trade Center (WTC) site. Additional discussion focuses on the potential for impacts to the area’s historic and parkland assets, such as St. Paul’s Chapel and its associated graveyard. The analysis focuses on the elements of the FSTC that would result in the presence of prominent above-ground structures – the Entry Facility, located on Broadway between Fulton and John Streets; the Dey Street Access Building, located on Dey Street at the current location of 189 Broadway; and other related entrances to the FSTC.

9.1.1 CONTEXT AND KEY ISSUES

The visual and urban design character that existed prior to September 11 in the study area was characterized primarily by the presence of the WTC towers and associated superblock. Views from Fulton and Dey Streets to the west of the proposed site for the FSTC were of the structures of the WTC complex (and the WTC plaza). The Fulton Street – Broadway Nassau Station Complex (Existing Complex) offered little contribution to the streetscape and to wayfinding for visitors.

The events of September 11 caused substantial visual impacts to Lower Manhattan. Although the Existing Complex was not directly affected, its setting was substantially altered by the destruction of the WTC, including the loss of the WTC Port Authority Trans-Hudson (PATH) station and the Cortlandt Street subway station and the structural damage to surrounding buildings, streetscapes and infrastructure in the WTC vicinity. Since September 11 the WTC site has been cleared and a temporary WTC PATH station reopened within the site. Damaged buildings have been repaired and rebuilding of destroyed structures is being advanced. The subway stations near the WTC site (Cortlandt Street and the WTC Stations) have reopened, with the exception of the Cortlandt Street Station, which remains closed.

Although the pre-September 11 WTC complex had a defining visual and character effect on the area surrounding the project site, the immediate area surrounding the site of the FSTC is considered to be similar to that which existed pre-September 11. The analysis therefore compares the construction and
operation of the FSTC against the prevailing future conditions in the study area for each of the analysis years, both with and without the project.

9.1.2 CONCLUSIONS

The No Action Alternative would not allow the achievement of the operational benefits of the FSTC and the associated improvements for wayfinding, urban design and visual resources. The Existing Complex would remain in its current condition and the potential for the creation of a visual focal point for Lower Manhattan subway transit would not be achieved.

During construction, both Alternatives 9 and 10 would require the removal of five (5) buildings – four (4) along John Street that would be replaced by construction of the Entry Facility and one (1) on the corner of Broadway and Dey Street which would be replaced by the Dey Street Access Building. The Corbin Building’s façade and existing uses would remain the same under Alternative 9. Under Alternative 10, the same five (5) buildings would be removed and the Corbin Building would be acquired by Metropolitan Transit Authority (MTA) New York City Transit (NYCT) and adaptively reused within the FSTC Entry Facility.

Temporary disruption to wayfinding could affect visitors, residents and workers throughout the immediate area during construction under both alternatives. The retail character of the area would be temporarily affected, through displacement of businesses and short-term access disruptions. These potential impacts would be minimized via a Pedestrian Wayfinding Plan, implemented during construction by NYCT. Other potential construction impacts include the visual presence of construction facilities and equipment, such as sidewalk bridging, drilling rigs, cranes, earth moving equipment, portable sanitary facilities, field offices, perimeter barriers and temporary staging areas. These impacts would be temporary, as streets and sidewalks would be returned to their original state following the completion of construction. As such, the proposed FSTC under both Alternatives 9 and 10 is not expected to result in substantial adverse impacts to urban design features within the immediate and surrounding areas.

The initial and full operation of the FSTC would have a positive long-term impact on visual resources and urban design in the study through enhanced wayfinding and the establishment of an attractive and efficient transit hub. The FSTC would provide a visual focal point into Lower Manhattan, benefiting residents, workers and visitors and improving the efficiency of the transit system in Lower Manhattan. Both Alternatives 9 and 10 would provide these operational benefits. However, Alternative 10 would provide better access to the Entry Facility from patrons approaching from the west and would provide a more direct connection to the subsurface Dey Street Passageway, which is shifted to the north in Alternative 9. Integration of the Corbin Building under Alternative 10 would enhance the visible presence of the Entry Facility. The FSTC would strengthen the east-west connectivity in Lower Manhattan and act as a principle link to the rebuilt WTC and Memorial. The main Entry Facility and Dey Street Access Building would afford views from the facility to the surrounding streets, improving orientation for transit patrons. The FSTC would also contribute to historic preservation in Lower Manhattan through the design of the FSTC, which, under both Build Alternatives, would be sensitive to the historic setting and context of the Corbin Building, surrounding historic properties and the John Street-Maiden Lane Historic District.

Table 9-1 summarizes the potential impacts of each alternative.
### Table 9-1

Summary of Comparison of Alternatives: Urban Design

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>No Action</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>No contribution to recovery.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>The Existing Complex would remain in its current condition, and the potential for the creation of a visual focal point for Lower Manhattan subway transit would not be achieved.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Corbin Building does not benefit from state ownership or increased public access.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Some views temporarily obscured by construction.</td>
<td>Pedestrian Wayfinding Plan, signage.</td>
<td>FSTC has visible presence/identity improving the area's urban design.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary disruption to wayfinding and increased congestion during construction.</td>
<td>Pedestrian Wayfinding Plan, signage, Maintenance and Protection of Traffic Plan (see Chapter 6).</td>
<td>Contributes to Lower Manhattan recovery by strengthening the Fulton Street corridor and improving east-west connections to and from WTC; Congestion reduced and amenities provided; wayfinding improved.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corbin Building Isolated.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Corbin Building does not benefit from state ownership or increased public access.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corbin Building may be visually obscured.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Views of Corbin Building restored.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temporary disruption to wayfinding and increased congestion during construction.</td>
<td>Pedestrian Wayfinding Plan, signage, Maintenance and Protection of Traffic Plan (see Chapter 6).</td>
<td>Contributes to Lower Manhattan recovery by strengthening Fulton Street corridor and improving east-west connections to/from WTC; Congestion reduced and amenities provided; wayfinding improved.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alternative 10</td>
<td>Corbin Building underpinned and integrated into the FSTC.</td>
<td>Corbin Building benefits from state ownership and increased public access.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Corbin Building may be visually obscured.</td>
<td>N/A</td>
<td>Views of Corbin Building restored.</td>
<td>As 2008</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


### 9.2 STUDY AREA

The study area for the analysis of urban design and visual resources comprises a quarter-mile radius from the FSTC (see Figure 9-1). The study area reflects the extent of potential effects of the FSTC on urban design and visual resources and incorporates the areas which are visible from the FSTC and from which the FSTC itself is visible. The quarter-mile study area shown in Figure 9-1 establishes the approximate limits of observer viewpoints or locations from which the visual changes generated by the project will be
examined in this chapter to determine the project’s visual impact. The study area encompasses views from Church Street/WTC site to the west, City Hall Park to the north, Broadway to the south and Fulton/John Streets to the east. Portions of the study area not directly linked visually to the project site were included to characterize the overall visual context of the project site in Lower Manhattan.

Figure 9-2 is a key map showing the location and direction of views. Views of the project site from a distance – not necessarily from the edges of the quarter-mile study area from Figure 9-1 – show the key area-wide viewsheds. These views illustrate the effect of the project in a broader visual context.

9.3 METHODOLOGY

To assess the potential impact of the FSTC on urban design and visual resources in the study area, an assessment of existing visual resources and urban design was prepared based on field reconnaissance. Data collection techniques included primary analysis, such as visual observations and photographs (see Figure 9-2), supported by consultation with secondary sources, including:

- Sanborn Maps;
- New York City Street Maps;
- Federal, State and City agency sources;
- The Mayor’s Office; and,
- Lower Manhattan Development Corporation (LMDC).

Based on information collected, the assessment described and evaluated the potential impacts of the FSTC on the following components of urban design and visual resources within the study area:

**Urban Design**

- Street Patterns, Block Form and Street Hierarchy;
- Streetscape Elements; and,
- Building Bulk, Use, Type and Arrangement.

**Visual Resources**

Visual resources identified by New York State Department of Environmental Conservation (NYSDEC) in its visual analysis guidance documentation (NYSDEC, 2000)\(^1\) include, but are not limited to:

- Scenic and aesthetic resources, places and quality;
- Public view corridors and vistas;
- Properties eligible for inclusion in the National or State Register of Historic Places (more discussion on historic resources is in Chapter 11: Cultural Historic Resources); and,
- Locally-designated visual resources (including parks and City-designated historic Landmarks, see Chapter 8: Public Open Space and Parklands and Chapter 11: Cultural Resources).

Please see Appendix F for further details on visual analysis guidance documentation.

---

\(^1\) “Assessing and Mitigating Visual Impacts - Department ID: DEP-00-2” New York State Department of Environmental Conservation, Division of Environmental Permits, 2000.
9.4 AFFECTED ENVIRONMENT

9.4.1 URBAN DESIGN

The street-level presence of the FSTC would be comprised of the Entry Facility, the Dey Street Access Building and secondary stair and elevator access points to the transit system (see Figure 9-3). These elements would be located in an area of New York City characterized by a range of building heights and street-level retail. The high-rise buildings in the City’s Financial District in the vicinity of Broadway, Church, Dey, Fulton and John Streets and diverse retail establishments on Broadway, Fulton and John Streets comprise the main locations that would be visible from the FSTC and from which the FSTC could be seen.

The proposed location of the Entry Facility is on the east side of Broadway, extending approximately 160 feet eastward into the block bounded by Broadway, Fulton, Nassau and John Streets. The proposed site of the Dey Street Access Building is located on the south corner of Dey Street at Broadway. Five (5) buildings currently occupy the proposed site of the Entry Facility and one (1) building currently occupies the proposed site of the Dey Street Access Building. These buildings range from single story retail spaces to a 12-story commercial structure. There are several existing subway entrances in the vicinity of the site of the proposed Entry Facility.

The properties on the proposed site of the Entry Facility currently support retailers and boutiques, offices and service-oriented businesses (see Broadway streetwall looking east – Figure 9-4). Tenants at 189 Broadway (the proposed location of the Dey Street Access Building) include sporting goods and retailers (see corner of Dey Street and Broadway – Figure 9-5, Plate 1). Further details on the occupants of these properties are provided in Chapter 7: Social and Economic Conditions and Appendix E.

Beginning at the southern end of the block, the Corbin Building at 192 Broadway is the most visually notable of the properties on the site (see Figure 9-3). This building is located on the north corner of John Street at Broadway (Broadway between John and Fulton Streets), although its main entrance is at 13 John Street (see Figure 9-5, Plate 2). The ground floor is occupied by a mix of retail establishments. This eight (8)-story 1888 office building was designed by Francis H. Kimball at the behest of Long Island Railroad president Austin Corbin. The building features a brick, stone and terra cotta polychromy exterior and its interior vaulted ceilings employ a Guastavino tile system (see Chapter 11: Cultural Resources for further details). The building is divided horizontally with a three (3)-story brownstone base and brick above and is articulated by a series of one (1)- to three (3)-story arcades, several with projecting cast iron bays. Frances H. Kimball was one of the most important early skyscraper designers in New York City and was also a pioneer in the use of ornamental terra cotta. This is especially notable on the Corbin Building, with its elaborate terracotta columns, window enframements and scalloped arches. The Corbin Building has been recently listed in the National Register of Historic Places. A full description of the Corbin Building is provided in Chapter 11: Cultural Resources.

The building immediately to the north of the Corbin Building (194-196 Broadway) is a three (3)-story terra-cotta storefront structure with large glazed openings (see Figure 9-4). While the storefront does not extend beyond the ground floor, the upper floors relate to it visually in form and detail. Elaborate cornice elements and other decorative features have been preserved on the upper two (2) floors.
Plate 1: Broadway Streetwall Looking East

Plate 2: Broadway Streetwall Looking West

Figure 9-4
A two (2)-story building across Broadway from the proposed site of the Entry Facility and on the south side of Dey Street, on the proposed location of the Dey Street Access Building, is 189 Broadway, which includes retail on both floors (see Figure 9-5, Plate 1). The properties adjacent to 189 Broadway currently support retailers, boutiques and service-oriented businesses.

Opposite the proposed site of the Entry Facility on the west side of Broadway is 195 Broadway. This 25-story building is a National Register-eligible neoclassical office building constructed in 1912-1913, with additional work between 1921 and 1924. The building was the first home of the American Telephone and Telegraph Company (AT&T).

Street-level activity in the vicinity of the Existing Complex is diverse and busy, including sidewalk retail (see Figure 9-5, Plate 3) and fast food restaurants, accessible by steps leading down from the sidewalk. Streetscape items include many commercial signs and cladding. Other streetscape items include a postal box and a temporary newsstand that occupy the southeast corner of Broadway and Fulton Street. The project area subway entrances located in between retail establishments compete with the signage of these retail establishments for visual attention and are generally visually inconsistent as wayfinding elements (see subway entrance photo on Figure 9-5, Plate 4).

Subway entrances are advertised along the streetwalls and with tall sidewalk bollards along Fulton and John Streets (see Figure 9-5, Plate 4). Street-level activity on John Street includes a diverse range of commercial establishments and retail stores (see Figure 9-5, Plate 6). John Street also includes a narrow subway entrance.

**STREET PATTERNS, BLOCK FORM AND STREET HIERARCHY**

**Broadway** - Within the study area, Broadway is the most visually distinctive thoroughfare. With the Civic Center to the north and the Financial District to the south (see Figure 9-5, Plate 7), Broadway is a four (4)-lane, southbound-only major avenue, and extends within the study area from the north end of Manhattan to Bowling Green. The blocks and surrounding streets are arranged in an irregular pattern. The small, irregular shapes of the blocks, vestiges of New York’s early history, contribute to the area’s urban design character. As a result of the irregular street pattern, views down John Street are framed by angled streetwalls. Sections of local streets, such as Nassau, Fulton and John Streets, are closed to vehicular traffic for part of the day by movable pedestrian guardrails near Broadway. Broadway and the surrounding streets are characterized by heavy vehicular and pedestrian traffic (see Chapter 6: Traffic and Transportation).

**Fulton Street** - Fulton Street is a three (3)-lane, local, westbound street, extending from the East River at South Street Seaport to Chamber Street at the WTC site and represents a major east-west pedestrian axis in Lower Manhattan. Looking eastward, Fulton Street’s axis shifts southward at Gold Street, where the typical Lower Manhattan dense, urban environment changes to a more open streetscape in the vicinity of the Southbridge Tower residential complex, whose buildings are set back from the street. A section of Fulton Street is closed to vehicular traffic by movable pedestrian guardrails near Broadway (see Chapter 8: Public Open Space and Parklands, for more details). Near Broadway and the subway stations, the street is characterized by heavy pedestrian traffic that uses both street and sidewalk for passage during peak periods (see Figure 9-5, Plate 8).

**John Street** - John Street is a two (2)-lane, local, eastbound street, extending from Broadway to the East River; it is located between Maiden Lane to its south and Fulton Street to its north. John Street intersects Broadway at a slight angle and almost aligns with Dey Street on the west side of Broadway. The blocks are longer and more regular to the west near Broadway, where a section of John Street is closed to vehicular traffic for part of the day by movable pedestrian guardrails (See Chapter 8: Public Open Space for details). Near Broadway, John Street is characterized by moderately heavy pedestrian traffic that uses both street and sidewalk for passage during peak periods (see Figure 9-5, Plate 9).
Plate 1: 189 Broadway, looking west

Plate 2: 192 Broadway, looking east

Plate 3: View of Broadway between Fulton and John Streets, looking north

Plate 4: Entrance to existing complex on Fulton Street (South side)
Plate 5: View of Fulton Street, looking west

Plate 6: View of storefront in 192 Broadway, on John Street

Plate 7: View of Broadway, looking south

Plate 8: Fulton Street between Nassau and William Streets, looking west
Plate 9: View of John Street, looking east

Plate 10: View of Dey Street, looking west

Plate 11: Kiosk at Liberty Plaza Park

Plate 12: Interim Planters on Broadway, looking south
Plate 13: St. Paul's Chapel

Plate 14: View of Nassau Street, looking north

Plate 15: Marine Midland Bank

Plate 16: One Liberty Plaza Entrance, looking south

Figure 9-5 (Continued)
Plate 21: View of Fulton Street between Nassau and William Street, looking east

Plate 22: View of 2 story building on corner of John Street and Broadway, looking west

Plate 23: View of 192 Broadway, 3 blocks to the north from Liberty Park Plaza

Plate 24: Sunny south exposure at 192 Broadway due to low 2 story building across John Street (see Plate 22 above)
Plate 25: View of Dey Street from Church Street, looking east; Corbin Building in the background

Plate 26: View west across Church Street, toward PATH Station and WTC Site, from Dey Street

Plate 27: 192 Broadway north facade and exterior fire escape

Plate 28: One Liberty Plaza
**Dey Street** - Dey Street is a two (2)-lane, local, westbound street, extending one (1) block from Broadway to Church Street and aligning close to John Street on the east side of Broadway. Dey Street is heavily used by vehicular traffic as a service street for a major discount department store, Century 21, which is located on the block between Church Street, Cortlandt Street and Dey Street and which has entrances on all three (3) streets. Due to this, Dey Street experiences heavy truck traffic at its loading docks (see view of Dey Street, Figure 9-5, Plate 10).

**STREETSCAPE ELEMENTS**

**Broadway**

The Alliance for Downtown New York (Downtown Alliance), a not-for-profit Business Improvement District (BID), is leading the implementation of a streetscape plan for Lower Manhattan. Portions of this plan have now been implemented, including new way-finding signage in front of St. Paul’s Chapel and Liberty Plaza Park and at other selected locations (see Figure 9-5, Plate 11), and improvements on Broadway, including new sidewalks, new granite curbs with inscribed street names, new bollards, new street and pedestrian lighting and granite markers in the sidewalk indicating the date of, and reason for, historic ticker-tape parades in the City.

There are no street trees along Broadway between Fulton and Liberty Streets, although there has been an effort by the City to introduce small-boxed evergreen shrubs between John Street and Maiden Lane (see Figure 9-5, Plate 12).

St. Paul’s Chapel on Broadway between Vesey and Fulton Streets is a streetscape-defining national landmark with a steeple, church and graveyard occupying the full block created by Broadway, Fulton, Vesey and Church Streets (see Figure 9-5, Plate 13).

**Fulton Street**

To the east along Fulton Street’s south side, the commercial streetscape remains intact until Gold Street. Moving east on the north side, larger commercial office buildings break up the small-scale retail character, concluding with the Strand Bookstore. At Gold Street, a traffic island with landscaping and mature trees has been installed on the north side.

Fulton Street functions as a pedestrian traffic artery and shopping street for tourists and local office workers during the day. It is generally less busy during evenings and weekends, once office workers have returned home.

**John Street**

To the east of the Existing Complex, John Street’s streetscape continues to be predominantly commercial up to and beyond Nassau Street. Street signage becomes less diverse to the east. While the retail character remains, new residential conversions have altered some of the old former commercial buildings. In addition to being closed to vehicular traffic for part of the day by movable pedestrian guardrails, occasional cultural events are also held on John Street. For example, Les Halles Bar and Grill hosts a Bastille Day celebration each year on July 14, during which time the street is closed. John Street does not have any street trees.

**Dey Street**

A key service street for Century 21’s loading docks, Dey Street is visually dominated by the large-scale neo-classical southern façade of 195 Broadway, a historic structure (see Chapter 11: Cultural Resources for further details). To the east of Century 21, a series of low buildings on the south side of Dey Street comprise street-level food and retail establishments. These lower structures allow southern light to penetrate Dey Street. A seven (7)-story office building butts up against Century 21 and its loading docks.
There are no trees along Dey Street. The WTC site is located directly to the west of Dey Street. Further west, the WFC is also visible from Dey Street.

**Nassau Street**

Nassau Street is a pedestrian shopping street largely closed to regular traffic. It is composed of a series of landscaping features to strengthen the character of this historic street, including bishops crook lampposts, historic bollards and brick paving. There are no trees along Nassau Street (see Figure 9-5, Plate 14).

**BUILDING BULK, USE, TYPE AND ARRANGEMENT**

**Broadway**

The irregularly sized blocks and historical styles on Broadway have created a heterogeneous array of office and retail building arrangements from block to block. This diversity of buildings is typical of the study area, which includes a variety of building shapes, arrangements and massing. The following describes the urban design character of Broadway in the vicinity of the project site, from Cortlandt Street in the south to Park Row in the north.

Between Fulton and Liberty Streets, Broadway is characterized by a wide variety of urban design elements. Between Cortlandt and Dey Streets, 19th century “skyscrapers” adjoin single-story contemporary retail properties, similar in character to Broadway’s east side between Fulton and John Streets. Between Maiden Lane and John Street are other examples of more recent building styles. On the east side of Broadway, three (3) early 20th century commercial buildings with stone façades rise over 20 stories without setbacks from the street. These buildings contrast with One Liberty Plaza, on Broadway between Liberty and Cortlandt Streets, one of several modern high-rise office buildings in the study area. These later skyscraper buildings typically are freestanding structures of large massing, occupying full blocks, block fronts or corners on Broadway, sometimes set back from the street with wide sidewalks or open space surrounding them. The buildings include the 1967 Marine Midland Bank (140 Broadway) with Noguchi’s Cube (a public sculpture) in front (see Figure 9-5, Plate 15). Public open spaces in the area (see Chapter 8: Public Open Space and Parklands) are generally paved and contain shrubbery and seating. One Liberty Plaza, built in 1972, is a single commercial skyscraper set back from the street on the west side, surrounded by a plaza (see Figure 9-5, Plate 16).

Between Dey Street and Vesey/Ann Streets, Broadway’s mix of urban design elements continues. Located on the west side of Broadway between Dey and Fulton Streets is 195 Broadway, an historic early 20th century, 25-story commercial neo-classical structure (see Figure 9-5, Plate 17). Just north of the Existing Complex on the east side of Broadway between Fulton and Ann Streets is 222 Broadway, a commercial curtain-wall tower whose substantial bulk is softened by a sidewalk arcade at-street-grade (see Figure 9-5, Plate 18). The building at 222 Broadway is a steel and glass office building dating to the 1960s, built to its lot line on Fulton Street except for a recessed entrance on Broadway. Across from 222 Broadway stands the historic St. Paul’s Chapel, surrounded by a landscaped graveyard, occupying the entire city block and fronting the street behind a wrought iron fence (see Figure 9-5, Plate 13). St. Paul’s uniqueness is reinforced by its deep setbacks from the street, in contrast with its neighboring buildings’ façade alignment with Broadway’s lot line frontage.

Further to the north of Vesey and Ann Streets, Broadway intersects with Park Row at the location of City Hall Park. This park is surrounded by a district characterized by government and commercial buildings (see Figure 9-5, Plate 19). City Hall Park is framed by towers on the west (including the prominent Woolworth Building), Park Row commercial buildings to the south and the Municipal Building to the east (see Figure 9-5, Plate 20). City Hall sits within the northern portion of the Park. The Brooklyn Bridge connects into the street network to the east of the park, making it a key gateway to Manhattan.
**Fulton Street**

Fulton Street contains a mixture of office, retail and transportation uses. Buildings are built to the lot lines without setbacks. Buildings vary in bulk, ranging from small rowhouses of approximately 10,000 gross square feet (gsf) to large buildings, such as 222 Broadway. Early 20th century commercial buildings of over 15 stories rise straight up without setbacks, reinforcing the narrow appearance of Fulton Street. This narrow character is somewhat alleviated at the southeast corner of Broadway and Fulton by the presence of a low two (2)-story structure. On cross streets such as Fulton Street, short, brick and stone-clad buildings ranging from four (4) to five (5) stories are present. These buildings have small footprints, measuring typically 25 feet wide and 100 feet deep, and are attached. Their primary façades and entrances face the street. At Gold Street, the Southbridge Tower Complex blocks views to the east and is framed by the buildings along Fulton Street. It includes park-like urban spaces surrounded by six (6)-story buildings with taller buildings behind (see Figure 9-5, Plate 21). Transportation uses include a multi-level, street-level and underground subway station complex between William Street and Broadway.

**John Street**

John Street contains primarily a mixture of office, retail and transportation uses. The Existing Complex is accessible from John Street and is an important transportation use in the study area. John Street’s mix of retail, office and converted residential structures is built up to the lot lines, without setbacks. On John Street, buildings vary in bulk, ranging from small rowhouses of approximately 10,000 gsf to large buildings. Early 20th century commercial buildings of over 15 stories rise straight up to a substantial height without setbacks, reinforcing the narrow dimensions of John Street. Similar to Fulton Street, this narrow character is interrupted at the southeast corner of Broadway and John Street by the presence of a low two (2)-story structure (see Figure 9-5, Plate 22). Between Broadway and Gold Street, on cross streets such as John Street, buildings are short, brick and stone-clad structures ranging from four (4) to five (5) stories. These buildings have small footprints, measuring typically 25 feet wide and 100 feet deep, and are attached with their primary façades and entrances facing the street (see Figure 9-5, Plate 9).

**Dey Street**

195 Broadway, a seven (7)-story office building is located adjacent to Century 21 on the south side of Dey Street. (see Figure 9-5, Plate 10). The north side of Dey Street towards Church Street is occupied by the Millenium Hotel, a large modern structure set back on Church Street.

**9.4.2 VISUAL RESOURCES**

The description below provides an overview of the key visual resources in the vicinity of the FSTC, using the streets surrounding the project site as a basis for describing the various visual resources, their character and their visual relationship with the project site. These resources include historic resources and open spaces discussed in more detail in Chapter 8: Public Open Space and Parklands and Chapter 11: Cultural Resources. The effects of the FSTC on these resources are discussed in this chapter from the perspective of urban design and visual character. The visual analysis of effects of the FSTC on these resources also informs the analyses presented in Chapters 8 and 11 and in Chapter 22: Section 4(f) Evaluation, where these resources are discussed from an open space, parklands and historic resource perspective.

**Broadway**

Broadway extends from the vicinity of the Existing Complex in a straight line south toward Battery Park. Broadway is a character-defining visual resource in the study area, as the Financial District frames the view toward Battery Park (see Figure 9-5, Plate 7). Looking north from the Existing Complex vicinity, City Hall Park frames the view beyond the Woolworth Building toward the Civic Center (see Figure 9-5, Plate 18).
Viewed at a distance from the south, the Corbin Building creates an important visual presence on Broadway, characterized by bright sunlight on its unobstructed southern façade (see Figure 9-5, Plates 23 and 24). The Corbin Building is eligible for listing on the National Register of Historic Places and is described in more detail in Chapter 11: Cultural Resources. Unobstructed views of the Corbin Building from the south are possible due to the low, two (2)-story building on the southeast corner of John Street at Broadway (see Figure 9-5, Plate 23). Located on Broadway is the former AT&T Building at 195 Broadway, directly opposite the project site, which forms an uninterrupted streetwall.

**Fulton Street**

From Fulton Street, views of the World Financial Center (WFC) to the west are framed against the sky by St. Paul’s Chapel and the mature trees in its graveyard west of the Chapel itself. St. Paul’s Chapel is a National Historic Landmark and a New York City Landmark. St. Paul’s Chapel is New York City’s oldest public building in continuous use and its only remaining colonial-era church. A more detailed discussion of St. Paul’s Chapel and its graveyard is presented in Chapter 11: Cultural Resources and Chapter 8: Public Open Space and Parklands.

To the east, Fulton Street angles to the south, creating narrowly framed views of the Southbridge Tower complex’s buildings and trees in the distance, and with the trees of Triangle Park at Gold Street in the foreground (see Figure 9-5, Plate 21). A visually dominant structure on Fulton Street is the 10-story Bennett Building at 139 Fulton Street. This National Register-eligible and New York City Landmark building dates back to 1872 and is believed to be the tallest cast iron building ever erected. A more detailed discussion of this resource is presented in Chapter 11: Cultural Resources.

The south side of Fulton Street, starting about one-half block to the east of Broadway, forms the northern boundary of the proposed John Street-Maiden Lane Historic District. The proposed District has been deemed eligible for listing in the National Register of Historic Places. The district is characterized by late-19th and early-20th century skyscraper office buildings. Most of the buildings pre-date the 1916 Zoning Resolution that established setback requirements and represent experimental forms in early skyscraper design. The buildings were built speculatively, based on their proximity to Wall Street, and many originally housed aspects of the jewelry industry. The proposed John Street-Maiden Lane Historic District is discussed in more detail in Chapter 11: Cultural Resources. A defining visual characteristic of the Fulton Street and Broadway intersection is the bright and airy atmosphere created by the low density, leafy setting of St. Paul’s Chapel and the low-rise buildings on the project site (see Figure 9-5, Plate 6).

**John Street**

John Street provides extensive views to the east from Broadway to Cliff Street. The visual character of John Street east of Broadway is considered an important aspect of the proposed John Street-Maiden Lane Historic District. As John Street angles to the south, narrowly framed views of 111 John Street at Cliff Street close off a view of light and sky (see Figure 9-5, Plate 9). To the west, views from John Street are limited to the commercial buildings on the west side of Broadway, due to the angling of Dey Street toward the south. A defining visual characteristic of the John Street and Broadway intersection is the bright and airy context created by the low-rise building on the southeast corner (see Figure 9-5, Plate 22). Likewise, as John Street intersects Broadway, Broadway’s west streetwall at this location is irregular and airy, due to the low, two (2)-story retail structure 189 Broadway on the corner of Dey Street (see Figure 9-5, Plate 1).

**Dey Street**

Dey Street provides an important visual resource, as the axis of the street provides direct views of the WTC site to the west, and beyond to the WFC (see Figure 9-5, Plate 10). To the east, Dey Street is directly on axis with the west face of the Corbin Building, described earlier (see Figure 9-5, Plates 25 and 26). The north side of Dey Street is formed by the historic building at 195 Broadway, described previously.
9.4.3 PUBLIC ART RESOURCES

Visual resources also include public art and design elements throughout the Existing Complex, including “Art in Motion” installations (NYCT sponsored art in transit facilities) and items recognized and protected by the NY State Historic Preservation Office.

9.5 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACTS

9.5.1 PRE-SEPTEMBER 11 REFERENCE CONDITION

The visual and urban design character that existed prior to September 11 in the larger study area was characterized primarily by the presence of the WTC towers and associated superblock. Views from Fulton and Dey Streets to the west were of the structures of the WTC complex (and the WTC plaza). Although the WTC complex had a defining effect on the larger area surrounding the project site, most of the immediate area surrounding the site of the FSTC prior to September 11 was similar to that currently existing.

9.5.2 ANALYSIS YEAR 2005/2006 (CONSTRUCTION)

NO ACTION ALTERNATIVE

Under the No Action Alternative, the visual character of the Existing Complex would not change except for routine maintenance repairs that would not alter the visual character of the Existing Complex. Under this alternative, none of the project elements described in Chapter 1: Purpose and Need, would be constructed.

Several other Lower Manhattan revitalization projects in the study area are expected to have begun or be completed by 2006. Of particular relevance to visual resources and to urban design are the streetscape plan being implemented by the Downtown Alliance, the WTC Memorial and Redevelopment Plan, the new Permanent WTC PATH Terminal and the planned revitalization of Fulton Street (see Section 9.5.3). These projects are independent from the Proposed Action and are expected to change the visual context in the Study Area.

The Downtown Alliance’s Streetscape Plan would have been fully implemented by 2006. Proposed elements to be installed in the next several years would include: streetlight replacement (matching those on Broadway) throughout the study area and new sidewalk and curb improvements. In addition, the Downtown Alliance would continue assisting property owners with storefront improvements, façade lighting and seasonal plantings. The Fulton Street corridor is envisioned as a premier retail, arts and entertainment thoroughfare for Lower Manhattan and a study is currently underway by the LMDC to articulate more concretely the future of the Fulton Street corridor.

These projects collectively represent major transformations to Lower Manhattan and are expected to draw large numbers of new workers, residents and visitors through area streets, including the streets that provide access to and from the Existing Complex. The anticipated revitalization intended by these projects would further highlight the inadequacy of the Existing Complex in terms of wayfinding and orientation and convenient access to the subway system. Although these projects are independent of the FSTC and would be expected to be constructed with or without the FSTC, the Existing Complex would continue to lack a strong identity both above and below grade. The Existing Complex would continue to be disconnected from the character of the streets discussed above and subway entrances located between retail establishments would continue to compete with the signage of these retail establishments for visual attention, a condition at odds with wayfinding standards. In general, the No Action Alternative would not support the revitalization goals of Lower Manhattan, as it would not improve orientation and wayfinding at both street-level and subway level. In this regard, the No Action Alternative would effectively detract from the revitalizing changes in Lower Manhattan when viewed in the context of other independent actions.
ALTERNATIVE 9

Construction of Alternative 9 would require deconstruction of all the existing buildings on the proposed site of the Entry Facility, with the exception of the Corbin Building, which would be structurally and functionally isolated from the Entry Facility. The existing building at 189 Broadway would also be deconstructed and replaced with the Dey Street Access Building. In addition, new Americans With Disabilities Act (ADA)-compliant elevators and additional stair access points to the transit system from sidewalks at Church, Dey John, Fulton and Nassau Streets and along Broadway would be part of the FSTC (refer to Chapter 4, Figure 4-1 and Figure 9-3).

With this alternative, the Corbin Building’s existing uses and façade would be maintained in its present configuration (refer to Chapter 3, Figures 3-5 and 3-6). The existing floor plate and north (rear) wall would maintain their full integrity as building components and would not be integrated into the overall interior scheme for the FSTC. The easement in the southern part of the Corbin Building that provides access to the subway from John Street would no longer function as such in Alternative 9, as access to the subway would instead be provided via the Entry Facility north of the Corbin Building.

Potential visual impacts associated with the construction of the FSTC include sidewalk bridging, drilling rigs, cranes, earth moving equipment, portable sanitary facilities, a field office, perimeter barriers, building deconstruction, new structures and staging. These impacts would be temporary, as streets and sidewalks would be returned to their original state following the completion of construction (for more details, see Chapter 4: Construction Methods and Activities). During construction of the Dey Street Access Building and the Entry Facility, temporary street and sidewalk closures would be required throughout the study area (see Chapter 4: Construction Methods and Activities). Portions of the street surfaces of both Fulton and William Streets would be opened during the cut-and-cover operations for the construction of other project elements and sub-surface improvements, such as the widening of the mezzanine. For the duration of construction, protected temporary bypass sidewalks and bridges would be introduced along the construction perimeter. In addition, access to building entrances and Century 21’s loading docks would be temporarily impaired. Alternative temporary access points to these buildings may be required, potentially impacting existing façades on adjoining streets. An easement allows for a future stair/escalator that would pass through a southern portion of the Millenium Hotel and would be accessed through knockout panels southward onto the Dey Street right of way.

Construction impacts on scenic and aesthetic resources would be temporary. The defining bright and airy visual characteristics of the Fulton Street and Broadway intersection would be impacted by large cranes, staging and perimeter barriers around the construction site. The lot line edges that characterize Broadway’s streetscape would be temporarily interrupted at the construction site, due to sidewalk bridging, staging material and machinery. These activities would also temporarily affect public view corridors and vistas. Establishing coordination among projects to avoid or minimize interruption in access and views to cultural sites and visual resources would be undertaken to address these impacts. In addition, the presence and concurrent use of heavy equipment and construction amenities within key viewsheds would be addressed through careful sequencing and scheduling of construction activities.

While the Corbin Building’s south façade would remain largely unobstructed when viewed from the south on Broadway, façade stabilization interventions may be required along the façade and sidewalk bridging would be required at the base along John Street and at the corner of Broadway and John Street, temporarily affecting the visual character of John Street. The sensitive location and design of the stabilization interventions and sidewalk bridging (required along Broadway and Fulton Streets as well) would be undertaken to address these potential impacts.

Construction of proposed new secondary elevator and stair access points to the transit system from sidewalks at Church, Dey, John, Fulton and Nassau Streets and along Broadway would include:

- Sidewalk stairs: west side of Church and Dey Streets (two (2) sets); northeast and northwest corner of Dey and Church; entrance at the Millenium Hotel (southwest corner); Broadway and Cortlandt Streets (southeast and southwest corners).
• Elevators: southwest corner of Dey and Church Streets; southeast corner of Fulton and Nassau Streets; southeast corner of John and William Streets.

The view along Dey Street from Church Street to the Corbin Building on Broadway would be impacted due to cut-and-cover operations along the length of Dey Street, characterized by heavy equipment and temporary structures. Along these sidewalks, new construction from the street to platforms and subsurface passageways below would occupy part of the sidewalk. Part of the sidewalk and curb lane would be closed during construction (refer to Chapter 4: Figure 4-1). A Pedestrian and Vehicular Access, Circulation, Maintenance and Protection Plan would be implemented throughout the construction zone to ensure that sufficient alternate street, building and station access during construction period is maintained.

Wayfinding and signage would continue to be factors for visitors, residents and workers throughout the immediate area around the construction zone. As a corollary, the area’s retail character would be impacted, as decorative shop signs would be temporarily obstructed by scaffolding, bridging and large machinery. To address these issues, wayfinding strategies would include the implementation of a “Pedestrian Way-Finding Plan” during construction. Appropriate signage for businesses and civic amenities would be added and public awareness promoted through mechanisms such as signage, a telephone hotline and Web site updates. A Visitor Center/Project Information Office would be established during construction, with sensitivity to local cultural resources and visual resources. Public information outlets that would receive and provide current information about access during construction would be identified. NYCT would coordinate construction of the FSTC with the implementation of the Downtown Alliance Streetscape Plan. It is anticipated that the portion of the Streetscape Plan between Park Row and Maiden Lane would be implemented following construction of the FSTC.

Dust resulting from construction activities may intermittently affect visibility in the area while construction is ongoing and settle on building surfaces, contributing to the perception of a “construction zone”. In order to avoid or minimize these potential impacts, dust would be addressed through measures such as spraying of a (non-hazardous, biodegradable) suppressing agent on dust pile; containment of fugitive dust; and adjustment for meteorological conditions as appropriate, erection of site barriers and enforcement of strict containment guidelines and proactive monitoring. These measures would be established in the project Construction Environmental Protection Program (CEPP) and implemented by NYCT.

ALTERNATIVE 10

Construction of Alternative 10 would require deconstruction of all the existing buildings on the proposed site of the Entry Facility, with the exception of the Corbin Building, which would be structurally and functionally integrated with the Entry Facility. The existing building at 189 Broadway would also be deconstructed and replaced with the Dey Street Access Building. In addition, new elevator and stair access points to the transit system from sidewalks at Church, Dey, John, Fulton and Nassau Streets and along Broadway would be part of the Proposed Action (refer to Chapter 4: Figure 4-1 and Figure 9-3).

With this alternative, the Corbin Building’s existing uses and ground-floor façade would be replaced by transportation-related and retail uses as part of the adaptive reuse of the Corbin Building (refer to Chapter 3, Figures 3-11 and 3-12). The Entry Facility would incorporate entrances on Fulton Street, Broadway and John Street that would provide public access to this historic building. The original entrance of the Corbin Building on Broadway would be restored and may be one of several entrances to the FSTC. On John Street, the entrance that presently exists would remain the main entrance to the upper floors.

Potential visual impacts associated with the construction of the FSTC include sidewalk bridging, drilling rigs, cranes, earth moving equipment, portable sanitary facilities, a field office, perimeter barriers, building deconstruction, new structures and staging. These impacts would be temporary, as streets and sidewalks would be returned to their original state following the completion of construction (for more details, see Chapter 4: Construction Methods and Activities). During construction of the Dey Street Access Building and the Entry Facility, temporary street and sidewalk closures would be required throughout the study area (see Chapter 4: Construction Methods and Activities). Portions of the street
surfaces of both Fulton and William Streets would be opened during the cut-and-cover operations for the construction of other project elements and sub-surface improvements, such as the widening of the mezzanine. For the duration of construction, protected temporary bypass sidewalks and bridges would be introduced along the construction perimeter. In addition, access to building entrances and Century 21’s loading docks would be temporarily impaired. Alternative access points to these buildings may be required, potentially impacting existing façades on adjoining streets. An easement allows for a future stair/escalator that would pass through a southern portion of the Millenium Hotel plaza and basement below and would be accessed through knockout panels southward onto the Dey Street right-of-way.

Construction impacts on scenic and aesthetic resources would be temporary. The defining bright and airy visual characteristics of the Fulton Street and Broadway intersection would be temporarily impacted by large cranes, staging and perimeter barriers around the construction site. The lot line edges that characterize Broadway’s streetscape would be temporarily interrupted at the construction site, due to sidewalk bridging, staging material and machinery. These activities would also temporarily affect public view corridors and vistas. Establishing coordination among projects to avoid or minimize interruption in access and views to cultural sites and visual resources would be undertaken to address these impacts. In addition, the presence and concurrent use of heavy equipment and construction amenities within key viewsheds would be addressed through careful sequencing and scheduling of construction activities.

The Corbin Building’s south façade would be temporarily obstructed when viewed from the south on Broadway due to the required full-height scaffolding along John Street and at the corner of John Street and Broadway for façade stabilization, repair and cleaning. The defining bright and airy visual characteristics of the John Street and Broadway intersection would be impacted by the full-height scaffolding over the north sidewalk along the perimeter of the Corbin Building. The location and design of the temporary scaffolding would be carefully configured to avoid visual impacts to John Street. Similarly, the sensitive location and design of the sidewalk bridging required along Broadway and Fulton Streets would be undertaken to address similar impacts.

Construction of the proposed new secondary elevator and stair access points to the transit system from sidewalks at Church, Dey, John, Fulton and Nassau Streets and along Broadway would include:

- Sidewalk stairs: west side of Church and Dey Streets (2 sets); northeast and northwest corner of Dey and Church Streets; entrance at the Millennium Hotel (southwest corner); Broadway and Cortlandt Streets (southeast and southwest corners).
- Elevators: southwest corner of Dey and Church Streets; southeast corner of Fulton and Nassau Streets; southeast corner of John and William Streets.

The view along Dey Street from Church Street to the Corbin Building on Broadway would be temporarily impacted, due to cut and cover operations along the length of Dey Street, characterized by heavy equipment and temporary structures. Along these sidewalks, new construction from the street to platforms and subsurface passageways below would occupy part of the sidewalk. Part of the sidewalk and curb lane would be closed during construction (refer to Chapter 4: Figure 4-1). A Pedestrian and Vehicular Access, Circulation, Maintenance and Protection Plan would be implemented throughout the construction zone to ensure that sufficient alternate street, building and station access during the construction period is maintained.

Wayfinding and signage would continue to be factors for visitors, residents and workers throughout the immediate area around the construction zone. As a corollary, the area’s retail character would be impacted, with decorative shop signs obstructed by scaffolding, bridging and large machinery. To address these issues, wayfinding strategies would include the implementation of a Pedestrian Way-Finding Plan during construction. Appropriate signage for businesses and civic amenities would be added and public awareness promoted through mechanisms such as signage, a telephone hotline and Web site updates. A Visitor Center / Project Information Office would be established during construction, with sensitivity to local cultural resources and visual resources. Public information outlets that would receive and provide current information about access during construction would be identified.
Dust resulting from construction activities may intermittently affect visibility in the area while construction is ongoing and settle on building surfaces, contributing to the perception of a “construction zone”. In order to avoid or minimize these potential impacts, dust would be addressed through measures such as spraying of a (non-hazardous, biodegradable) suppressing agent on dust pile; containment of fugitive dust; and adjustment for meteorological conditions as appropriate, erection of site barriers and enforcement of strict containment guidelines and proactive monitoring. These measures would be established in the project CEPP and implemented by NYCT.

9.5.3 ANALYSIS YEAR 2008 (INITIAL OPERATION)

NO ACTION ALTERNATIVE

Under the No Action Alternative, the FSTC would not be constructed. The No Action Alternative assumes that the visual character of the Existing Complex would not change, except for routine maintenance repairs that would not alter the visual character of the Existing Complex. Under this alternative, none of the project elements as described in Chapter 1: Purpose and Need would be constructed.

As described in Chapter 2: Analysis Framework, a number of other projects in the study area are expected to have begun or to have been completed by 2008. Of particular relevance to visual resources and urban design are the Downtown Alliance’s Streetscape Plan, the WTC Memorial and Redevelopment Plan, the new Permanent WTC PATH Terminal and the revitalization of Fulton Street.

The Downtown Alliance’s Streetscape Plan would have been fully implemented by 2008. Proposed elements to be installed in the next several years would include the following: streetlight replacement (matching those on Broadway) throughout the study area and new sidewalk and curb improvements. In addition, the Downtown Alliance would continue assisting property owners in storefront improvements, façade lighting and seasonal plantings. The proposed improvements intend to maintain a consistent architectural language to enhance wayfinding throughout the Lower Manhattan BID (see Figure 9-6) and would not be maximized in the absence of the FSTC.

Without the FSTC, the Existing Complex would continue to lack a strong identity both above and below grade. Rather than announcing the arrival into the Existing Complex as early as possible through its direct association with wayfinding and streetscape strategies, the transit system would continue to be disconnected from the character of the streets above (see Figures 9-6 and 9-7). Without the FSTC and its hierarchy of clear, distinct and ordered signs, subway entrances between retail establishments would continue to compete with the signage of these retail establishments for visual attention, a condition at odds with wayfinding standards and the desire for a respectful context to the historic Corbin Building.

Within the Study Area, the development of the WTC Memorial, a Permanent WTC PATH Terminal, new commercial/cultural developments on the site of the WTC, the Wedge of Light Plaza and Freedom Tower are currently undergoing environmental review and, if implemented, would be in varying stages of completion by 2008.

According to studies by the LMDC and the Mayor’s Office, the Fulton Street Corridor is envisioned as a premier retail, arts and entertainment thoroughfare for Lower Manhattan. By the year 2008, a growing number of residential conversions and new construction projects would have begun to change the character of the Fulton Street Corridor. A series of strategies targeted to this Corridor could affect transformations, including increasing the number of housing units; diversifying retail, arts and entertainment activity; creating new usable open spaces; and generating around-the-clock street life. A revitalized Fulton Street Corridor could transform Fulton Street into a river-to-river east-west pedestrian thoroughfare, linking the new WTC and Hudson riverfront with areas east of Broadway all the way to the South Street Seaport area and the East River (LMDC, 2003).
1. Project Site: Orientation and wayfinding challenges.

2. Project Site: Concept to strengthen orientation and wayfinding.
1. & 2. Entrances to subway from street.

3. Stairs connecting street and subway levels.

4. Passageway connecting subway lines and egress to street-level.
Finally, other area projects currently underway or proposed and likely to be completed by 2008 include improvements to West Street (Route 9A) and the new South Ferry Subway Terminal. The continued presence of a mix of visually competing storefronts at the site of the Entry Facility would detract from the intended future role of Fulton Street as a major east-west artery through Lower Manhattan, replete with retail, arts, cultural and entertainment activities. Tied into the proposed developments listed above, the Fulton Street Corridor is the intended target for major investments and incentives to develop it into a commercial and cultural magnet. The existing visual character of the Existing Complex and surroundings would be dissonant with the future character of Fulton Street and would detract from the revitalization of Fulton Street and Lower Manhattan as a whole intended by ongoing planning efforts.

**Broadway**

The Corbin Building’s south façade would remain largely unobstructed when viewed from the south on Broadway and the lot line edges that characterize Broadway’s historic streetscape would remain intact between Fulton Street and John Street. Viewed from Broadway several blocks to the north, St. Paul’s Chapel and 195 Broadway would continue to stand out as major landmarks, free from nearby visual construction impacts. The present confusing and poor visual identity of existing subway entrances that are obscured by retail signage would continue. Viewed from Broadway several blocks to the north, the corner of Fulton Street would offer little evidence of the numerous transit facilities below street-level.

**Fulton Street**

The defining visual characteristics of Fulton Street and the intersection with Broadway would remain intact, as would key view corridors and vistas. However, from Fulton Street to the east, the corner of Broadway and Fulton Street would continue to offer little visual indication of the presence of the Existing Complex (see Figure 9-6). Rather than announcing the arrival into the transit system as early as possible through its direct association with wayfinding and streetscape strategies, the Existing Complex would continue to be disconnected from the character of the streets above. Without the proposed FSTC and its hierarchy of clear, distinct and ordered signs, subway entrances in between retail establishments would continue to compete with the signage of these retail establishments for visual attention (see Figure 9-7). From the WTC site and the Wedge of Light Plaza to the west, Fulton Street leading to Broadway would offer little evidence visible from a distance to visitors of the transit facility subsurface.

**John Street**

The Corbin Building would continue to be a landmark on the corner of Broadway and John Street. The wayfinding identity of entry to the subway points along the street would continue to compete with the signage of retail establishments for visual attention.

**Dey Street**

The view east along Dey Street from Church Street to the Corbin Building on Broadway would remain largely intact. Foot traffic would be more intense and wayfinding challenges will continue to be a factor for visitors, residents and workers throughout the immediate area due to major adjacent projects underway. Without the Dey Street Access Building, the view east along Dey Street from the Permanent WTC PATH Terminal would provide little wayfinding information.

**ALTERNATIVE 9**

**Urban Design**

Under this alternative, the existing uses and appearance of the Corbin Building would be maintained in its present configuration. The existing floor plate and north (rear) wall would maintain their full integrity as building components and the Corbin Building property would not be integrated into the overall interior scheme of the FSTC (see Figure 9-8).
Under this alternative, safety egress required by code, which is presently possible through the fire escape stairs along the north (rear) façade of the Corbin Building, would be adversely impacted (see Figure 9-5, Plate 27). An alternate means of egress would be maintained, through a pedestrian passage between the Entry Facility and the north façade of the Corbin Building. This would either use the existing fire escape located on the north façade of the building, with modifications to access the passageway, or by the construction of a new stair tower. The precise design of the fire egress would be determined during Final Design. The FSTC would be constructed and operated so as not to be inconsistent with existing zoning designations. The analysis of the urban design impacts of development under existing zoning controls is based on the conceptual site plans. These plans comply with bulk regulations of the zoning resolution now applicable to the properties.

**The Entry Facility**

The FSTC Entry Facility would be a square-shaped mixed-use building. The building would be approximately 160 feet wide along Broadway and 130 feet deep along Fulton Street. The building would be built to its front lot lines with a floor plate of almost an acre. The Entry Facility would be a highly visible building, intended to express a strong identity for the transit system above and below grade. To fully integrate the Entry Facility into Lower Manhattan, the planning, detailing and selection of materials and the placement of amenity, information sources and street furniture would be intended to ease the transition between indoor and outdoor spaces.

The Entry Facility would contain an interior space of civic scale. The form of the building would be organized around a large interior space – the Central Station Concourse. This central space would rise through the entire Entry Facility, connecting all levels from below grade up to the rooftop. The Entry Facility design is described in more detail in Chapter 3: Alternatives. It would comprise four (4) levels above street-level and three (3) below. It is envisaged that visitors would move easily between the Entry Facility and surrounding streets through multiple entrances. Potential retail amenities would be partially distributed along Broadway and primarily accommodated to Fulton Street and the eastern edges of the Entry Facility or located at mezzanine levels elevated above ground. Potential integration of street-level retail in the Entry Facility at Broadway and Fulton Street would serve to maintain continuity of the existing retail frontage along these streets and support the Fulton Street corridor development.

Main entrances to the Entry Facility along Broadway and Fulton Street would open directly into the transit system with clear sightlines into the concourse levels below and above. By creating the largest possible opening to the subsurface concourse level, views and natural light would be introduced deep into the Entry Facility, both at the center and along the building’s street edges. The overall effect is intended to announce arrival into the transit system as early as possible and to create the strongest and most direct association between the streetscape and transit system. The interior elevations opening directly onto the central space from the concourse would be visible when viewed from Broadway or Fulton Street.

The level below street-level in the Entry Facility is intended as a location for transit-wide information services and a visitors’ center, as it would be visible to both transferring passengers and those entering and exiting the system. One (1) level below this would include a connection to the Dey Street Passageway.

Above street-level, there would be open views between the Entry Facility and the surrounding streets. Upper levels would be primarily reserved for public amenity and could accommodate a combination of exhibition and retail space, with space on the higher mezzanines to accommodate plant equipment required at high level with limited disruption to activities in the Central Station Concourse below.

It is anticipated that the façade of the Entry Facility would be made of contemporary materials. The façade would allow views into and out of the facility to the north and west. The Entry Facility entrances would be located at street-level on the northern and western side of the facility. All entrances would be designed for ADA access.
1. Concept for Entry Facility.

2. Concept for Dey Street Passageway.

3. Existing wayfinding signs at selected locations.
The Dey Street Access Building

The Dey Street Access Building would be a new building located at the south corner of Dey Street at Broadway, on a site of approximately 4,600 square feet (sf). The new building would replace the existing two (2)-story building at 189 Broadway. Its geometry would also follow the dimensions of the 189 Broadway building. The Dey Street Access Building would consist of a three (3)-story atrium at street-level and two (2) basement levels, one (1) connected to the 4 5 line at the platform level, and the other connected to the Dey Street Passageway at the concourse level. The roof would support mechanical equipment.

The architectural character of the Dey Street Access Building would be consistent with that of the Entry Facility so as to express a common unifying visual presence of the subway facilities in the area and will be designed in accordance with the urban design and historic character of the area. The Dey Street Access Building would be highly visible, providing clearly identifiable access to the Dey Street Passageway, and would not be expected to create a negative visual impact to its setting or the study area.

The design of new elevator and stair access points to the transit system proposed from sidewalks at Church, Dey, John, Fulton and Nassau Streets and along Broadway will be coordinated with the improvements proposed by the Downtown Alliance Streetscape Plan on Broadway which include: street signage; lighting; and use of specific building materials intended to maintain a consistent architectural language to enhance wayfinding throughout the Lower Manhattan BID.

Street Patterns, Block Form and Street Hierarchy

Alternative 9 would not be expected to impact the topography or natural features of the study area. Since the FSTC would be built within existing block configurations, Alternative 9 would maintain the existing street patterns, block form and street hierarchy of the study area. This alternative would not have any adverse impacts on these urban design characteristics.

Streetscape Elements

The design of Alternative 9 would provide for the Entry Facility and the Dey Street Access Building to be built to their respective lot lines and provide a streetwall along both sides of Broadway at Fulton and Dey Streets. Under this alternative, the sidewalks on these streets would be enhanced with new amenities, which could include decorative paving, new lighting and landscape features. At the Entry Facility, a policy of design guidelines would be implemented to create a hierarchy of signs to ensure that the presentation of potential retail offerings and wayfinding signage remains clear, ordered and distinct (see Figures 9-6 and 9-8). Finally, these design guidelines would provide a respectful context to the historic Corbin Building. NYCT will coordinate with the Downtown Alliance to ensure compatibility with the Streetscape Plan. Coordination will focus on street entrances, lighting and signage to building materials—all intended to maintain a consistent architectural language to enhance wayfinding throughout the Lower Manhattan BID.

Building Bulk, Use, Type and Arrangement

The construction of Alternative 9 would eliminate some retail and office space (and consequently economic activity) to make way for the Entry Facility on Broadway (see Chapter 7: Social and Economic Conditions), but the Entry Facility’s Fulton Street façade would continue to have a predominantly commercial use.

The FSTC would support the area’s successful revitalization. The Fulton Street Corridor Plan would be strengthened by the transformation of existing retail and fast-food outlets at the site of the Entry Facility into an attractive and efficient transit hub. It is anticipated that the Entry Facility would include street-level retail uses on both Broadway and, to a lesser extent, on Fulton Street, thereby maintaining continuity of street-level activities and the visual expression of this economic vitality. Fulton Street’s intended
future role as a major east-west corridor, replete with retail, arts, culture and entertainment activities, would positively affect the urban design of the parcels and the study area. The development of the WTC Memorial, a Permanent WTC PATH Terminal, new commercial/cultural developments on the site of the WTC, the Wedge of Light Plaza and Freedom Tower would be strengthened by a 24-hour, attractive and efficient transit hub on the Fulton Street Corridor. The FSTC, while independent from the other projects, would be one of the key new visual elements that would contribute to a strong visual identity of the newly revitalized Fulton Street Corridor.

Alternative 9 would result in the construction of a single modern building on the combined parcels on Broadway, north of the Corbin Building. The FSTC Entry Facility would alter the built form of the existing properties, including building type, use, bulk and arrangement, through the introduction of a single, mid-rise uniform civic structure in place of attached commercial and office buildings of widely varying heights. The urban design of the FSTC would be intended to be complementary with the Corbin Building and similar older, mid-sized buildings in the study area.

The placement of the Entry Facility to the outside lot lines would be comparable to that of the older buildings in the area, including the Corbin Building. Existing building shapes vary considerably in the study area and include styles such as the traditional streetwall buildings on Broadway, as well as freestanding towers, also on Broadway, between Maiden Lane and Liberty Street. The shape of the Entry Facility would be designed to be compatible with these diverse surroundings. The civic/transportation and commercial use of the building would also be compatible with the study area, which is largely defined by commercial developments along Broadway and the east-west streets, many with subway entrances at their basement levels, such as 195 Broadway.

The bulk of the Entry Facility would amount to approximately 100,000 gsf. This would be in keeping with the varied building bulk in the study area, from the Corbin Building (approximately 50,000 gsf) to the Marine Midland Bank (approximately one (1) million gsf). The building floor plate of approximately 40,000 sf would be in keeping with the variety of sizes in the study area. In addition, the length and width of the building would also be compatible with other larger buildings in the study area, such as 222 Broadway.

Floor-Area Ratio (FAR) is used to measure the bulk of a given building in relation to footprint. The FAR of the Entry Facility, at approximately 2.5 FAR, would be below the FAR of 15 of the C5-5CR (Restricted Central Commercial) Zone, allowed under the existing zoning of the site (see Chapter 7: Social and Economic Conditions). Due to the dense nature of the study area, it is not expected that the bulk of the building would result in adverse impacts to urban design.

The heights of buildings within the study area vary considerably from block to block, ranging from the low commercial storefronts (approximately 30 feet), to the fabric of mid-rise historic “skyscrapers”, to the gigantic modern skyscraper (the U.S. Steel Building at One Liberty Plaza is 54 stories and approximately 750 feet). The projected maximum height of the Entry Facility would be lower than many of the taller and medium-height buildings already present in the study area (see Figure 9-5, Plate 28). The new building would likely be of a contemporary design, echoing the character of the existing modern buildings in the area yet sensitive to the adjacent historic Corbin Building. Therefore, while it is expected that the development under Alternative 9 would result in a prominent new presence in the study area that has a variety of use, type, arrangement and bulk from those presently on the project site, it would not result in an adverse impact on the area’s urban design.

**Visual Resources**

The scenic and aesthetic resources, places and quality are key elements of the visual resources analysis. The defining bright and airy visual characteristic of the Fulton Street and Broadway intersection created by the setting of St. Paul’s Chapel and the existing low-rise buildings on the project site would be maintained by this alternative, due to the low-density design of the proposed FSTC Entry Building and
Dey Street Access Building. Similarly, with respect to urban cultural parks, the amount of open space would be unchanged and would therefore not affect visual resources within the study area.

The public view corridors and vistas have been evaluated for impact by this alternative. Construction of the project would not obstruct view corridors or vistas along Broadway, Fulton Street’s view toward the WTC site, or historic resources such as St. Paul’s Chapel or 195 Broadway. The view of the Corbin Building’s north wall would be partly obscured by the Entry Facility along Broadway, viewed from the north; also from the north, the height and bulk of the Entry Facility would partly obscure the other party walls of adjacent buildings.

While the proposed FSTC buildings would not obstruct important view corridors and vistas, they would be designed to be highly visible from the surrounding streets, to enhance 24-hour wayfinding throughout the area. Viewed from the north along Broadway, the FSTC would have a strong presence on the corner of Broadway and Fulton Street. The Dey Street Access Building would provide a consistent wayfinding architectural language, but a more constrained presence on the west side of Broadway. At night, the Entry Facility would be a wayfinding beacon with a clear hierarchy of signage and provide a respectful context to the lighted St. Paul’s Chapel and 195 Broadway across the street. From Broadway several blocks to the south, the Corbin Building’s façade would be a landmark presence, with the Entry Facility present as a wayfinding element, but partly obscured behind the Corbin Building.

From the east on Fulton Street, the corner of Broadway and Fulton Street would be visually emphasized by the prominent Entry Facility, whose architectural language and signage hierarchy would reinforce the wayfinding identity of numerous transit entry points along the street. From the west at the WTC site, the Entry Facility would be a key wayfinding landmark along Fulton Street, visible from a distance. While not integrated into the Entry Facility, from the east along John Street, the Corbin Building would continue to be a landmark on the corner of Broadway and John Street. Slightly to the north of John Street’s axis, but still visible from the east of John Street, the Dey Street Access Building would be a key landmark announcing entry into the transit system. The building’s architectural language and signage hierarchy would clarify and reinforce the wayfinding identity of entry to the subway points along the street. From the Permanent WTC PATH Terminal, the view east along Dey Street would provide key wayfinding information, due to the visible presence of the Dey Street Access building, the Broadway and John Street corner of the Corbin Building and an edge of the Entry Facility.

Although subject to further design refinement during the engineering process, it is anticipated that the Entry Facility could include publicly accessible spaces at elevated levels, allowing for partial elevated views of the WTC site and unobstructed views of St. Paul’s Chapel and buildings along Broadway.

Public art and design elements throughout the existing FSTC complex, including Art in Motion installations and items recognized by the New York State Historic Preservation Office would be protected and, if necessary, relocated in accordance with applicable regulations. The FSTC would also be constructed under the MTA’s “Art for Transit” (AFT) program. In 1982, legislation was adopted mandating that all new construction projects allocate funds for public art. AFT would provide input to the selection of architectural firms; the design process; historic preservation of facilities; and the selection of public art installations. Sustainable design principles, including energy efficiency, natural day lighting, natural ventilation and material conservation, would be used throughout design and planning.

ALTERNATIVE 10

Urban Design

Under this alternative, the FSTC would be constructed and operated so as not to be inconsistent with existing zoning designations. The analysis of the urban design impacts of development under existing zoning controls is based on the conceptual site plans. These plans comply with bulk regulations of the zoning resolution now applicable to the properties.
**Entry Facility**

The FSTC Entry Facility would be a square-shaped mixed-use building. The building would be approximately 160 feet wide, excluding the Corbin Building (along Broadway), and 130 feet deep (along Fulton Street). The building would be built to its front lot lines with a floor plate of almost one (1) acre. The total size of the building would be approximately 100,000 gsf.

Under this alternative, the Corbin Building would be integrated structurally and functionally into the design of the Entry Facility. The Entry Facility would incorporate entrances on Broadway, Fulton and John Streets that seamlessly link into the continuous perimeter circulation area. Although the Corbin Building would continue to be seen and be accessible via its own entrance, Alternative 10, through its integration with the Entry Facility, would provide public access to this historic building. The original entrance of the Corbin Building on Broadway would be restored to serve as an entrance to the FSTC. On the John Street side, the entrance that presently exists would remain the main entrance to the upper floors.

Alternative 10 would incorporate the street-level of the Corbin Building as a major entrance into the Entry Facility. Connections at selected floors would be aligned and reminiscent of the adjacent former building floor levels, connecting to the Entry Facility as balconies. Portions of the Corbin Building north (rear) wall may remain as undeveloped unadorned surfaces to clearly mark original party and demising walls. The main floor façade of the Corbin Building, including the original bank entrance on Broadway, would be restored. Some of these spaces would serve as a major entrance to the FSTC. On John Street, the entrance that presently exists would remain the main entrance to the upper floors. Under Alternative 10, the existing floor plate and north (rear) wall would maintain their visual integrity, but not necessarily their integrity as building components and would be integrated into the overall interior scheme for the FSTC.

The Entry Facility would be designed to include clear delineation of the north (rear) wall and extent of original floor plate and a clear articulation of detail to distinguish the old and the new. In addition to the opening in the Entry Facility over the Central Station Concourse below, a portion of the floor slab would be removed in the Corbin Building to allow daylight to reach into the vertical circulation area connecting to the Dey Street Passageway two (2) levels below.

The form of the Entry Facility would be organized around a large interior space – the Central Station Concourse. This central space would rise through the entire Entry Facility connecting all levels from subsurface up to the rooftop. The Entry Facility design is described in more detail in Chapter 3: Alternatives. It would comprise four (4) levels above street-level and three (3) below. It is envisaged that visitors would move easily between the Entry Facility and surrounding streets through multiple entrances. Retail amenities would remain on Broadway and primarily accommodated to Fulton Street. Additional retail would be designated along the eastern edges of the Entry Facility or located at mezzanine levels elevated above ground. Main entrances to the Entry Facility along Broadway and Fulton Street would open directly into the transit system with clear sightlines into the concourse levels below. By creating the largest possible opening to the concourse level below grade, views and natural light would be introduced deep into the Entry Facility, both at the center and along the building’s street edges. The overall effect is intended to announce arrival into the system as early as possible and to create the strongest and most direct association between the streetscape and transit system. The interior elevations opening directly onto the central space would be visible when viewed from Broadway or Fulton Street.

The level below street-level is intended as a location for transit-wide information services and a visitors’ center, as it would be visible to both transferring passengers and those entering and exiting the system. One (1) level below this includes a connection to the Dey Street Passageway.

Above street-level there would be open views between the Entry Facility and the surrounding streets. Upper levels would be primarily reserved for public amenities and could accommodate a combination of exhibition and retail space, with space on the higher mezzanines to accommodate plant equipment required at high level with limited disruption to activities in the Central Station Concourse below.
It is anticipated that the façade of the Entry Facility would be made of contemporary materials. The façade would allow views into and out of the facility to the north and west. The Entry Facility would be located at grade on the northern and western side of the facility. All entrances would be designed for ADA access.

**The Dey Street Access Building**

The Dey Street Access Building would be a new building located at the south corner of Dey Street at Broadway, on a site of approximately 4,600 sf, and would be built to its outside lot lines. The new building would replace the existing two (2)-story building at 189 Broadway. Its geometry would also follow the dimensions of the 189 Broadway building. The Dey Street Access Building would consist of a three (3)-story atrium at street-level and two (2) basement levels, one (1) connected to the 4-5 line at the platform level, and the other connected to the Dey Street Passageway at the concourse level. The roof would support mechanical equipment.

The architectural character of the Dey Street Access Building would be consistent with that of the Entry Facility so as to express a common unifying visual presence of the subway facilities in the area and will be designed in accordance with the urban design and historic character of the area. The Dey Street Access Building would be highly visible, providing clearly identifiable access to the Dey Street Passageway and would not be expected to create a negative visual impact to its setting or the study area.

The design of new elevator and stair access points to the transit system proposed from sidewalks at Church, Dey, John, Fulton and Nassau Streets and along Broadway will be coordinated with the improvements proposed by the Downtown Alliance Streetscape Plan on Broadway, which include: street signage, lighting and use of specific building materials intended to maintain a consistent architectural language to enhance wayfinding throughout the Lower Manhattan BID.

**Street Patterns, Block Form and Street Hierarchy**

This alternative would not be expected to impact the topography or natural features of the study area. Since the FSTC would be built within existing block configurations, Alternative 10 would maintain the existing street patterns, block form and street hierarchy of the study area. This alternative would not have adverse impacts on these urban design characteristics.

**Streetscape Elements**

The design for Alternative 10 would provide for an Entry Facility and Dey Street Access Building that would be built to their respective outside lot lines and provide a streetwall along Broadway, Fulton and Dey Streets. Under this alternative, the sidewalks on these streets would be enhanced with new amenities, which may include decorative paving, new lighting and landscape features. At the FSTC, a policy of design guidelines would be implemented to create a hierarchy of signs to ensure that the presentation of retail offerings and wayfinding signage remain clear, ordered and distinct (see Figures 9-6 and 9-8). These design guidelines would be coordinated with the Downtown Alliance’s Streetscape Plan. Finally, these design guidelines would provide a respectful context to the historic Corbin Building. These elements would be expected to have a positive impact on the streetscape. The Entry Facility, through its strong visual presence, would aid wayfinding.

**Building Bulk, Use, Type and Arrangement**

The construction of Alternative 10 would eliminate some retail and office space (and consequently economic activity) to make way for the main entrance to the Entry Facility on Broadway (see Chapter 7: Social and Economic Conditions), but the Entry Facility’s Fulton Street façade and the Corbin Building’s John Street façade would continue to have a predominantly commercial use. It is anticipated that some retail uses would be located on Broadway as well.
The FSTC would support the area’s successful revitalization. The Fulton Street Corridor Plan would be strengthened by the transformation of the visually incoherent retail façade at the site of the Entry Facility into an attractive and efficient transit hub that integrates retail street frontage. It is anticipated that the Entry Facility would include street-level retail uses on both Broadway and (to a greater degree) on Fulton Street, thereby maintaining continuity of street-level activities. As it would integrate the Corbin Building into the Entry Facility, this alternative would also create opportunities to “activate” the John Street and Broadway side of the Corbin Building. The restored Corbin Building would contribute to the quality and character of the John Street Historic District while at the same time reinvigorating John Street and Broadway with new retail and providing seamless access from the subway system to John Street. Fulton Street’s intended future role as a major east-west corridor replete with retail, arts, culture and entertainment activities would positively affect the urban design of the parcels and the study area. The development of the WTC Memorial, a Permanent WTC PATH Terminal, new commercial/cultural developments on the site of the WTC, the Wedge of Light Plaza and Freedom Tower would be strengthened by a 24-hour attractive and efficient transit hub anchoring the Fulton Street Corridor.

The FSTC Entry Facility would alter the built form of the existing properties, including building type, use, bulk and arrangement, through the introduction of a single, mid-rise uniform civic structure in place of attached commercial and office buildings of widely varying heights. The urban design of the project would be compatible with the Corbin Building and similar older, mid-sized buildings in the study area, contributing to the urban design unity.

The placement of the Entry Facility would be comparable to that of the older buildings in the area, including the Corbin Building. Existing building shapes vary considerably in the study area and include styles such as the traditional streeetwall buildings on Broadway, as well as freestanding towers, also on Broadway, between Maiden Lane and Liberty Street. The shape of the Entry Facility would be designed to be compatible with these diverse surroundings. The civic/transportation and commercial use of the building would also be compatible with the study area, which is largely defined by commercial developments along Broadway and the east-west streets, many with subway entrances at their basement levels, such as 195 Broadway.

The bulk of the Entry Facility, excluding the Corbin Building, would amount to approximately 100,000 gsf. This would be in keeping with the varied building bulk in the study area, from the Corbin Building (approximately 50,000 gsf) to the Marine Midland Bank (approximately one (1) million gsf). The building floor of approximately 40,000 sf would be in keeping with the variety of sizes in the study area (Corbin Building at approximately 5,600 sf to larger office towers on Broadway). In addition, the length and width of the building would also be compatible with other larger buildings in the study area, such as 222 Broadway.

The FAR of the Entry Facility, at approximately 2.5 FAR, would be below the FAR of 15 of the C5-5CR (Restricted Central Commercial) Zone, allowed under the existing zoning of the site (see Chapter 7: Social and Economic Conditions). Due to the dense nature of the study area, it is not expected that the bulk of the building would result in adverse impacts to urban design.

The heights of buildings within the study area vary considerably from block to block, ranging from the low commercial storefronts (approximately 30 feet), to the fabric of mid-rise historic “skyscrapers”, to the gigantic modern skyscraper (One Liberty Plaza is 54 stories and approximately 750 feet). The projected maximum height of the Entry Facility would be lower than many of the taller and medium-height buildings already present in the study area (see Figure 9-5, Plate 28). The new building would likely be of a contemporary design, echoing the character of the existing modern buildings in the area, yet sensitive to the adjacent historic Corbin Building. Therefore, while it is expected that the development under Alternative 10 would result in a prominent new presence in the study area that has a variety of uses, types, arrangement and bulk from those presently on the project site, it would not produce an adverse effect on the area’s urban design.
**Visual Resources**

The scenic and aesthetic resources, places and quality are key elements of the visual resources analysis. The defining bright and airy visual characteristic of the Fulton Street and Broadway intersection created by the setting of St. Paul’s Chapel and the existing low-rise buildings on the project site would be maintained by the alternative, due to the low-density design of the proposed Entry Facility and Dey Street Access Building. Similarly, with respect to urban cultural parks, the amount of open space would be unchanged and would therefore not affect visual resources within the study area.

The public view corridors and vistas have been evaluated for impact by this alternative. Construction of the project would not obstruct view corridors or vistas along Broadway, Fulton Street’s view toward the WTC site, or historic resources like St. Paul’s Chapel or 195 Broadway. The view of the Corbin Building’s north party walls would be partly impacted by the Entry Facility along Broadway, viewed from the north. From the north, the height and bulk of the Entry Facility would partly obscure the party walls of the Corbin building and adjacent buildings.

While the proposed FSTC buildings would not obstruct important view corridors and vistas, they would be designed to be highly visible from the surrounding streets, to enhance 24-hour wayfinding throughout the area. Viewed from several blocks to the north along Broadway, the FSTC would have a strong presence on the corner of Broadway and Fulton. The Dey Street Access Building would provide a consistent wayfinding architectural language, but a more constrained presence on the west side of Broadway. At night, the Entry Facility would be a wayfinding beacon with a clear hierarchy of signage and would provide a respectful context to the lighted St. Paul’s Chapel and 195 Broadway across the street.

From the south along Broadway, the Corbin Building’s façade would be a landmark presence, with the Entry Facility present as a wayfinding element, but partly obscured behind the Corbin Building. In this alternative, the Corbin Building’s street-level perimeter along Broadway and most of John Street would be integrated into and visibly part of the Entry Facility’s grand public space, thereby further emphasizing the Corbin Building as an important historic structure.

From the east along Fulton Street, the southeast corner of Broadway and Fulton Street would be visually emphasized by the prominent Entry Facility, whose architectural language and signage hierarchy would reinforce the wayfinding identity of numerous transit entry points along the street.

From the WTC site on the west, the Entry Facility would be a key wayfinding landmark along Fulton Street, visible at a distance. From the east along John Street, the Corbin Building would continue to be a landmark on the corner of Broadway and John Street. In this alternative, the Corbin Building’s street-level perimeter along most of John Street would be integrated into and visibly part of the Entry Facility’s grand public space.

Slightly to the north of John Street’s axis, but still visible from the east along John Street, the Dey Street Access Building would be a key structure announcing entry into the transit system. The building’s architectural language and signage hierarchy would clarify and reinforce the wayfinding identity of entry to the subway along the street. From the Permanent WTC PATH Terminal, the view east along Dey Street would provide key wayfinding information, due to the visible presence of the Dey Street Access Building, the Broadway and John Street corner of the Corbin Building and an edge of the new Entry Facility building.

Although subject to further design refinement during the engineering process, it is anticipated that the Entry Facility could include publicly accessible spaces at elevated levels within the Entry Facility, allowing for partial elevated views of the WTC site, unobstructed views of St. Paul’s Chapel and buildings along Broadway.
Public art and design elements throughout the existing FSTC complex, including Art in Motion installations and items recognized and protected by the NYS State Historic Preservation Office would be protected and, if necessary, relocated in accordance with applicable regulations. The FSTC would also be constructed under the MTA’s AFT program.

9.5.4 ANALYSIS YEAR 2025 (FULL OPERATION)

NO ACTION ALTERNATIVE

Under the No Action Alternative, it is anticipated that the general visual character of the Existing Complex would remain unchanged in 2025. Under the No Action Alternative, the FSTC would not be operational in 2025. The No Action Alternative assumes that the Existing Complex would remain as is, except for routine maintenance and repairs that would not affect the visual and urban design character of the study area.

As described in Chapter 2: Analysis Framework, a number of other projects in the study area are expected to be completed by 2025. Of particular relevance to visual resources and urban design are the WTC Memorial and Redevelopment Plan, the Permanent WTC PATH Terminal and the revitalization of Fulton Street. These changes will have brought about a transformation of Lower Manhattan, particularly the blocks surrounding the Existing Complex. The commercial development coupled with major infrastructure improvements will have taken hold, attracting new businesses and workers into the resurgent business district. Added to this new, primarily daytime population, will be the residential transformation of Lower Manhattan that will require additional growth in night-time activities, schools, civic amenities and services.

ALTERNATIVE 9

Under Alternative 9, the FSTC would be fully operational in 2025. As previously identified for the 2008 condition, the proposed project would continue to have a positive impact on the area’s urban design and visual resources.

Broadway

By 2025, Broadway’s symbolic status as “Canyon of Heroes” would be burnished by the completion of major streetscape improvements. On either side of Broadway’s spine, major transformations would have occurred by 2025, from the resurgent commercial district to the transformation into a deeply-rooted residential community. Increasing numbers of tourists would reinforce Lower Broadway’s role as a world-class tourist destination, from City Hall Park to a refurbished Battery Park. From Broadway several blocks to the south, the Corbin Building’s façade would be a landmark presence, with the Entry Facility present as a wayfinding element, but partly obscured behind the Corbin Building. Viewed from Broadway several blocks to the north or south, the FSTC’s strong, harmonious presence on the corner of Broadway and Fulton Street would be an important wayfinding amenity for visitor, resident and worker alike.

Fulton Street

By 2025, looking east from the WTC Wedge of Light, Fulton Street’s potential will have been realized. Its role as a major east-west artery through Lower Manhattan, replete with retail, arts, cultural and entertainment activities, would be anchored by major landmarks, civic amenities and tourist attractions, from river to river. BPC, the Wedge of Light, the leafy St. Paul’s Chapel, a refurbished Fulton Street market place and South Street Seaport would be linked by Fulton Street—and anchored by the attractive FSTC transit hub that would provide orientation and support 24-hour activity throughout the area.
John Street

The Corbin Building would continue to be a landmark on the corner of Broadway and John Street, a key component to John Street’s historic urban fabric of early tall buildings and its status as a historic district. Slightly to the north of John Street’s axis, but still visible from John Street from the east, the Dey Street Access Building would be a key landmark announcing entry into the transit system. Along John Street, the wayfinding identity of entry points to the subway system would be clearly demarcated.

Dey Street

By 2025, Dey Street would continue to be a major east-west link between the WTC site and points along Broadway. The Dey Street Access Building would provide a consistent wayfinding architectural language, but a more constrained presence on the west side of Broadway. At night, the Entry Facility would be a wayfinding beacon with a clear hierarchy of signage and provide a respectful context to 195 Broadway across the street.

ALTERNATIVE 10

Under Alternative 10, the FSTC would be fully operational in 2025. The proposed project would continue to have a positive impact on the area’s urban design and visual resources.

Broadway

By 2025, Broadway’s symbolic status as “Canyon of Heroes” would be burnished by the completion of major streetscape improvements. On either side of Broadway’s spine, major transformations would have occurred by 2025, from the resurgent commercial district to the transformation of its flanks into a deeply-rooted residential community. Tourists, already a daily feature today, will reinforce Lower Broadway’s role as a world-class tourist destination, from City Hall Park to a refurbished Battery Park. From Broadway several blocks to the south, the Corbin Building’s façade would be a landmark presence, with the Entry Facility present as a wayfinding element, but partly obscured behind the Corbin Building. Viewed from Broadway several blocks to the north or south, the FSTC’s strong, harmonious presence on the corner of Broadway and Fulton Street would be an important wayfinding amenity for visitor, resident and worker alike.

Fulton Street

By 2025, looking east from the WTC Wedge of Light, Fulton Street’s potential will have been realized. Its role as a major east-west artery through Lower Manhattan replete with retail, arts, cultural and entertainment activities would be anchored by major landmarks, civic amenities and tourist attractions, from river to river. BPC, the Wedge of Light, St. Paul’s Chapel, a refurbished Fulton Street market place and South Street Seaport would be linked by Fulton Street—and anchored by the attractive FSTC transit hub that provides orientation and generates 24-hour activity throughout the area.

John Street

The Corbin Building would continue to be a landmark on the corner of Broadway and John Street, a key component to John Street’s historic urban fabric of early tall buildings and its status as a historic district. Slightly to the north of John Street’s axis, but still visible from the east along John Street, the Dey Street Access Building would be a key landmark announcing entry into the transit system. As it would integrate the Corbin Building into the Entry Facility, by 2025, this alternative would have “activated” the John Street and Broadway side of the Corbin Building. The restored Corbin Building would contribute to the quality and character of the John Street Historic District while at the same time reinvigorating John Street and Broadway with new retail and providing seamless access from the subway system to John Street.
Dey Street

By 2025, Dey Street will continue to be a major east-west link between the WTC site and points along Broadway. The Dey Street Access Building would provide a consistent wayfinding architectural language, but a more constrained presence on the west side of Broadway. At night, the Entry Facility would be a wayfinding beacon with a clear hierarchy of signage and provide a respectful context to 195 Broadway across the street.

9.6 SUMMARY OF ADVERSE IMPACTS AND MITIGATION MEASURES

While the FSTC would have a positive long-term impact on the area’s visual resources and urban design through enhanced wayfinding and the establishment of an attractive and efficient transit hub, there would be some temporary adverse impacts during the project’s construction phase. No permanent adverse impacts are anticipated.

These temporary adverse impacts to the urban design and visual resources during the construction phase would include:

- Sidewalk bridging around the site, along Broadway, Fulton and John Streets (along the base of the Corbin Building);
- The presence of heavy equipment and site amenities within key viewsheds, including drilling rigs, cranes, earth moving equipment, portable sanitary facilities, a field office, perimeter barriers, building deconstruction, new structures and staging;
- The Corbin Building’s south façade would remain largely unobstructed in Alternative 9 except for possible façade stabilization measures and sidewalk bridging along John Street and the corner of Broadway. It is assumed that Alternative 10 would require full-height scaffolding along the entire façade;
- When viewed from Broadway to the south, the lot line edges that characterize Broadway’s historic streetscape would be temporarily interrupted at the construction site, due to sidewalk bridging, staging material and machinery;
- The view up Dey Street from Church Street to the Corbin Building on Broadway would be impacted, due to cut-and-cover operations along the length of Dey Street, characterized by heavy equipment and temporary structures;
- Wayfinding will continue to be a factor for visitors, residents and workers throughout the immediate area around the construction zone;
- The area’s retail character would be impacted, with decorative shop signs obstructed by scaffolding, bridging and large machinery; and,
- Dust will impact the area through lower visibility, coating area buildings, signs and glazing.

Mitigating measures would be undertaken, including but not limited to the following:

- Establishing coordination among projects to avoid or minimize interruption in access and views to cultural sites and visual resources;
- Incorporating design objectives to maximize the enhancement of visual resources and make a positive contribution to urban design and aesthetics;
- Mitigating impacts to key viewsheds and visual resources through sensitive location and design of sidewalk bridging;
- Mitigating the presence and concurrent use of heavy equipment and construction amenities within key viewsheds through careful sequencing and scheduling of construction activities;
- Preparing a Pedestrian and Vehicular Access, Circulation, Maintenance and Protection Plan throughout the construction zone. Sufficient alternative street, building and station access during the construction period will be maintained. Baselines for vehicular and pedestrian traffic levels of service ensuring east-west connectivity will be developed and monitored;
• Developing the Pedestrian Way-Finding Plan during construction. Appropriate signage for businesses and civic amenities would be added and public awareness promoted through mechanisms such as signage, a telephone hotline and Web site updates. Public information outlets that will receive and provide current information about access during construction would be identified;

• Implementing a CEPP to prevent construction impacts; and,

• Controlling dust related to the construction site through, among other things, spraying of a suppressing agent on dust piles (non-hazardous, biodegradable); containment of fugitive dust; and adjustment for meteorological conditions as appropriate, erection of site barriers, enforcement of strict containment guidelines and proactive monitoring.